THE SET OF CRITERIA TO DEFINE THE MOST PROMISING DIMENSION OF ICH'S VALORIZATION PROJECTS
D.T4.4.1
(WP T4, ACTIVITY A.T4.4)

Version 2
12 2019

Prepared by	PP8/UHAM Prof. Dr Gertraud Koch, Dr Eliane Fernandes Ferreira, Dr. Anna Stoffregen
Project number and acronym	CE1152 ARTISTIC Interreg CENTRAL EUROPE Programme
Project website	https://www.interreg-central.eu/Content.Node/ARTISTIC.html
Lead partner	T2i trasferimento tecnologico e innovazione
Address	Edmund-Siemers-Allee 1 (West)	20146 Hamburg	GER
Email	eliane.fernandes.ferreira@uni-hamburg.de
Delivery date	Final Version: December 27, 2019

Universität Hamburg
DER FORSCHUNG | DER LEHRE | DER BILDUNG

Introduction

This document presents the draft of criteria elaborated by UHAM to define the most promising dimension of ICH's valorization projects. The draft will be discussed during a web conference that will be held at the end of January 2020 between UHAM (PP08), the LP and the ARTISTIC project partners and associates. After the web conference, the project partners will organize and implement local events to present the set of criteria and discuss it with the local public actors. The local events will allow the partners and associates to present the set of criteria and discuss them with the local ICH stakeholders who will be also able to suggest improvements to the set of criteria. This discussion with the public actors is essential to make visible the different needs and situation of each region within the goals of the ARTISTIC project. After the conclusion of the events, all PPs will send their reports about the local activities to UHAM, relating the outcomes of the presentation and discussions with the public actors. UHAM will then collect all reports and present the "Report of tailored events to present the set of criteria" (D.T4.4.3).

Subsequently, UHAM will be able to produce together with all partners the "ARTISTIC Manifesto for ICH valorization" (D.T4.4.4) that targets social and marketing dimension of ICH and the diversification of resources required. The Manifesto will highlight the mission of private and public funds and the role of funding methods, i.a. Crowdfunding, for ICH valorization.

References and appendixes with more information about ICH's valorization and sustainable development are provided at the end of the document.

Criteria to define the most promising dimension of ICH's valorization projects

Before we set the criteria to define the most promising dimension of ICH's valorization projects, we need to remember some vital aspects regarding working with ICH. According to the UNESCO's Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH), "'intangible cultural heritage' means the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, skills – as well as the instruments, objects, artefacts and cultural spaces associated therewith – that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage" (UNESCO 2003). ICH offers communities and groups a sense of identity and continuity, promoting respect for cultural diversity and human creativity (Ibid.).

The safeguarding and valorization of ICH is the key to keeping traditional practices and knowledge alive. Through the ARTISTIC project, all project partners aim to support local partners who already work with ICH or wish to do so, valorizing and safeguarding it, also contributing with and promoting regional development in their regions. According to UNESCO, safeguarding means:

- ensuring the viability of the intangible cultural heritage,
- including the identification, documentation, research, preservation, protection, promotion, enhancement, transmission, particularly through formal and non-formal education,
- as well as the revitalization of the various aspects of such heritage. (UNESCO 2003)[1]

1.1. The Value of Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH)

Intangible Cultural Heritage is a driving force for economic development, comprising a diversity of productive activities, with monetary and nonmonetary value, strengthening local economies (UNESCO 2015: 9).[2]

---

[1] For more information about the UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage see: https://ich.unesco.org/en/convention (Retrieved February 4, 2019)

However, working with ICH valorization and as already aforementioned in the ARTISTIC toolset, it is of great importance for our ARTISTIC project to keep in mind that "the value of intangible cultural heritage is defined by the communities themselves" (UNESCO 2011: 4). UNESCO (Ibid.) stresses that the communities are the ones "who recognize these manifestations as part of their heritage and who find it valuable". It is a crucial point that must be respected kept in mind by us, partners, who wish to support public actors in the valorization of ICH to promote sustainable regional and local development.

Therefore, it is essential for us and for partners to keep in mind what UNESCO points out:

> "How much is lost if an annual festival that attracts people from outside the community does not take place this year? How much would be necessary to teach the community the knowledge and skills that allowed them to jointly organize the festival and perform in it? How much is lost if a traditional water or land management system for agriculture is distorted by short-term benefits-oriented market systems? The cost of depriving communities of their intangible cultural heritage is the economic damage produced when the direct or indirect economic values disappear, or the community's social cohesion and mutual understanding is under threat. The erosion or interruption of the transmission of the intangible cultural heritage might deprive the community of its social markers, lead to marginalization and misunderstanding, and cause identity fallback and conflict." (UNESCO 2011: 4)

To valorize ICH, promoting sustainable local development, we need to be aware of many aspects mentioned in the ARTISTIC strategy elaborated in collaboration with all partners. Therefore, we need to examine which criteria we need to be mindful of, so that ICH can be valorized and can promote economic development for a region correctly.

As mentioned in the ARTISTIC strategy, there is no secret recipe or standard model, which could easily be adapted for resourcing and financing ICH in every region and every type of ICH. The regional and local conditions are specific and diverse because <u>ICH is not a commodity like any other</u>.

Therefore, it is always important to remember that ICH is:
- interconnected with people and groups,
- embedded in historically grown social contexts
- entangled with the local environmental circumstances,
- demanding specific, individually tailored financing solutions.

Always take into account the UNESCO's "Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage" and the "Register of Best Safeguarding Practices" from UNESCO to respect the rules of safeguarding and empowering ICH.[3]

Intangible Cultural Heritage and Sustainable Development according to UNESCO

According to UNESCO (2015: 2), intangible cultural heritage can contribute to sustainable development along each of its three dimensions (economic, social and environmental) and to the requirement of peace and security as fundamental prerequisites for sustainable development. ICH is also part of the

---

[2] For more detailed information about ICH and sustainable development, see UNESCO's publication titled "Intangible Cultural Heritage and Sustainable Development" (2015), available at: https://ich.unesco.org/doc/src/34299-EN.pdf

[3] The "UNESCO's Register of Best Safeguarding Practices" is available online at https://ich.unesco.org/en/publications-of-the-lists-00492#register-of-best-safeguarding-practices (Retrieved February 7, 2019)

2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development that constitutes a plan of action addressing the three dimensions of sustainable development through 17 Sustainable Development Goals (Ibid.). Very important for our project is to keep in mind that these goals "must be underpinned by inclusive governance and the freedom for people to choose their own value systems" (UNESCO 2015: 3).

As UNESCO (2015: 9) writes, Intangible cultural heritage is vital to sustaining the livelihoods of groups and communities. ICH can help to generate income, fair trade and work "for a broad range of people and individuals, including poor and vulnerable ones". Therefore, ICH, if correctly valorized and safeguarded, can be a source of innovation for economic growth. It is always necessary to respect tradition and the essence of the specific ICH. UNESCO points out, that if necessary and possible, new materials could even be adapted to respond to old needs, "for example, when certain raw materials are scarce or unavailable, while old skills provide answers to new challenges, such as when timetested systems of cultural transmission are adapted to information and communications technologies" (UNESCO 2015: 10). Besides contributing to economic growth, intangible cultural heritage practices help to promote peace and to prevent or resolve disputes. (Ibid.: 11-12). Therefore, ICH's safeguarding also promotes peace and security (Ibid.: 12).

1.2. Undoing heritage

Once we start working with ICH valorization, there is the risk that commodification occurs. For instance, it could happen when we isolate ICH from its pristine processes and misuse it for economic growth, such as tourist purposes only. It also happens when the bearers of the ICH are not the beneficiaries but rather tourist associations or even companies. Moreover, it could also happen that external marketing might foster the image revaluation of a whole region or town more than the visibility or incomes of the creators or the bearers of an ICH. There is also the risk that commercialized products and staged rooms of production become more dominant, detaching it from the ICH and its community. Therefore, it is always crucial to keep in mind: **"the greater the gap to the bearers and creators is, the greater this risk becomes of undoing heritage!"**

Which are the criteria that define most promising dimension of ICH's valorization projects and make ICH an asset for regional development?

Laying on the ARTISTIC strategy and the results of the implemented pilot actions here follows a list of criteria to be discussed during the web conference with ARTISTIC partners and associates:

<u>Bring ICH to light, make it known, and visible</u>

- ♦ valorize, support, empower ICH for the benefit of the whole society, such as finding new solutions for integration, sharing culture and history and respect for different cultures and lifestyles, sustainable economic local development, valorization of intangible cultural heritage that often stay invisible to the eyes of the big part of society.

- ♦ Do not close ICH into museums but bring it closer and make it available to people's mind and heart.

- We are interested in an ICH that opens the mind and is accessible to everyone! For example, one of our projects in Italy valorises traditional songs by rediscovering the use of the dialect. Through it, we are reminded that part of our people migrated to America to earn their living. In such way, this project valorises ICH **and** gives us the opportunity to investigate and rediscover our heritage, to open our minds and consider migration in a different way.

- Keep in mind that "once the knowledge is lost, money cannot bring it back".

Particularities and specificities of ICH

- Each ICH is particular in respect to knowledge, mastery and expertise, which constitute the core that is to be maintained.

- **We need to understand and see ICH in its specific regional and local context!!!**

- **It is important and necessary to respect and take into account the specific regional conditions, adapting tools, methods and techniques to help local ICH actors to initiate or improve their projects.**

Inclusion of ICH bearers, groups and creators in all project phases

- ICH valorization projects must include the people who are the bearers of ICH in all project phases (from the planning until its conclusion). Therefore, it is necessary to involve the ICH bearers, community or group and accompany the development process of the ICH valorization project, supporting it in all ways and possibilities.

- Remember: **the greater the gap to the bearers and creators is, the greater the risk of ICH's commodification becomes**!

Respect
- We need to respect the essence, the needs and wishes of the ICH bearers, community or group without turning ICH only into a generic and banal product that could loose its importance, meaning and essential cultural value.

- We need to respect the intellectual property rights of the ICH bearers, community or group and support them in this issue.

- As partners, we must respect the ethical principles for safeguarding ICH according to UNESCO's "Ethical Principles for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage" (2015)

Support & visibility

- It is important to help the bearers to recognize and name their values and motivations, so that they can be detected or identified as ICH and other bearers can recognise it too.

- This "epiphany" (sudden revelation or insight) is of a great importance also to establish a future ICH based enterprise (its mission, vision and so on).

- In the support of ICH valorization projects, the project has come to speak about safeguarding, promoting and resourcing ICH rather than only financing it.

Professional Training:

- ♦ It is important to offer continuously technical skills and knowledge to ICH bearers, group or community so that they are able to start, develop or improve their cultural project, initiative or enterprise.

- ▪ It is necessary to train ICH local actors about different funding methods such as crowdfunding and machtfunding to enable them to start an ICH project or initiative.

- ♦ It is necessary to look closely not only at isolated financing models but also at a wide variety of cultural traditions ranging from oral traditions and expressions, performing arts, social practices, rituals and festive events, knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe to traditional craftsmanship to identify the suitable funding methods.

- ♦ Accompany the ICH actors in all project phases training them in the different skills such as communication improvement, marketing strategies and IPR.

Support at Networking

- ♦ **Build local, regional, national and transnational networks of cultural operators to empower ICH projects and initiatives, giving sustainability to ICH valorization projects and local development.**

- ♦ It is important to cooperate with local and regional institutions to promote the local ICH, contributing to its social recognition and presentation to other places and public groups.

Valorization of ICH's wealthiness

- ♦ It is vital to recognize ICH as something worthy of conservation.

- ♦ It is necessary to valorize regional history and its ICH groups and the rising local market, products and their cultural value.

- ♦ It is necessary to put ICH in broader contexts, for preserving, telling and re-writing the stories connected to it. Like this, we will strengthen the relevance of an ICH and maintain the knowledge for its preservation.

- ♦ Valorising cultural heritage means re-reading it and re-proposing it in an innovative way, not as a mere conservation of the past: during the project, we realised that we need to transmit culture in a generative sense and not like a static image or copy of the past. We cannot link our future to ancient times without questioning them. "If you want that ICH survives, you must innovate the way community and young people live their values and traditions" said one of our Italian cultural operators.

Recognizing ICH's potential and create spaces for ICH

- It is important to recognize ICH's potential and create spaces of it because innovation is potentially infinite, and it allows the heritage to live over time when transmitted.

- It is vital to open a space for reflection and experimentation of new connections and to foster the birth of new concepts and new practices, which enrich the culture itself in an innovative way.

- It is crucial to encourage stakeholders to become more actively involved: political actors and policymakers, scientists and intermediaries, financial operators and businesses.

People's identification with ICH

♦ To achieve local or regional sustainable development, it is important to promote the establishment of people's identification with an ICH and everything connected to it.

Besides it, the ARTISTIC project partners and associates shall:

Work in a sustainable way with ICH bearers, communities and groups

♦ Continuously provide information and training courses for ICH bearers, communities or groups, who want to start a project or initiative.

♦ Promote, encourage and frequently assist training activities in ICH valorization and sustainable development in the specific regions to give sustainability to the project.

♦ Continuously cooperate with the local public actors and ICH stakeholders to promote the valorization of ICH.

♦ In addition, at a local level, it is important to move towards associations and informal groups that already "practice" ICH projects in an uncoordinated way to make them consciousness about their role and growing potential.

Improve and foster networking among all involved actors

♦ Encourage and assist networking between the different groups to keep the goal of the ARTISTIC project alive.

♦ Support and improve the development of national, regional and local networks of different stakeholders to strengthen exchange and learning processes.

♦ Develop strategies to coordinate efficiently the regional network. It is an essential criterion to sustain the ICH valorization process. It helps to avoid the risk that some initiatives do not become visible due to the involvement of actors that do not interact in a synergetic way with each other.

Tracking of local, regional, national or transnational support

♦ It is important to identify where local, regional, national or transnational support can be sourced, such as chambers of commerce, trade associations, foundations, local, regional and state governments (such as the Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development). This must happen, attracting the attention and earning the trust of individuals and the public in general, convincing different stakeholders to become supporters and investors of the ICH initiative.

♦ The regional commitment to an ICH is indispensable, helping ICH bearers, community or group to find local, regional and national sponsors. Once the region officially understands a practice or a craft as ICH, citizens will also pay more attention to it. In addition, the people involved with ICH will feel respected and recognized which may lead to greater knowledge of the ICH and increased support for it. For instance, official local, regional and national labels can be used for advertising and facilitate the visibility of the ICH beyond the local context.

- It is also essential to promote the engagement of the whole community by volunteering, by providing spaces and material resources, by considering it in the routines of public administrative or private organisational work. It is at least as necessary as monetary finances for the local, sustainable development.

- Private investors should also be involved in local and regional ICH projects, raising their awareness of the fact that ICH assets generate profitability and can be financed.

- It is important to involve local small and-medium sized enterprises (SMEs) to valorize the ICH locally and foster the company identity and engagement.

Promote knowledge and experience exchange

- Promote knowledge and experience exchange between ICH valorization projects of Central European regions and abroad.

Suitable models for valorizing, administrating and financing ICH initiatives

- Help the projects in the different Central European regions to encounter different suitable models for valorizing, administrating, and financing ICH in the work with bearers and citizens as well with financial actors.

- Foster the project team to communicate effectively with the stakeholders (the reference group, the local public decisor and so on).

- Continuously monitoring of the endurance of the project team.

- Develop the idea that crowdfunding and additional financing methods are suitable tools for financing projects and new ICH related activities.

Local, regional and national regulations

- Sensitize the relevant local public actors and governments to propose and approve local, regional or national regulation, developing and implementing regional specific laws.

- Promote the topic of ICH valorization within regional and national programs and action related to the territorial strategic planning.

Link ICH to marketplace and public policies

- Link ICH related initiatives with specific and appropriate skills for future-oriented occupations.

- Create links and synergies with other public policies in order to optimize efforts and resources.

References:

UNESCO (2015): Intangible Cultural Heritage and Sustainable Development, URL: https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#8 (Retrieved Nov 4, 2019)

UNESCO (2003): "UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage", URL: https://ich.unesco.org/en/convention (Retrieved Feb 4, 2019)

UNESCO (2011): "Questions and Answers about Intangible Cultural Heritage", URL: https://ich.unesco.org/doc/src/01855-EN.pdf (Retrieved Feb 4, 2019)

UNESCO (2015): "Ethical Principles for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage" (Dec 4, 2015), URL: https://ich.unesco.org/en/ethics-and-ich-00866 (Retrieved Feb 4, 2019)

UNESCO: "UNESCO's Register of Best Safeguarding Practices", URL: https://ich.unesco.org/en/publications-of-the-lists-00492#register-of-best-safeguarding-practices (Retrieved Feb 7th, 2019)

UNESCO: "Kit for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage", URL: https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#6 (Retrieved Feb 7th, 2019)

For additional information see also „Cultural Resources Strategy for Sustainable Regional Development - The CCC Method" (2014), URL: http://www.culturalcapitalcounts.eu/images/pdf/CRS_web.pdf (Retrieved Jan 20 2020)

Universität Hamburg
DER FORSCHUNG | DER LEHRE | DER BILDUNG

Annex 1 - Ethical Principles for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage

As already mentioned in the ARTISTIC Toolset, when we work with ICH valorization and sustainable regional development, we need to be aware of the ethical principles for safeguarding ICH. The Ethical Principles for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage were developed in 2003, within the UNESCO's Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage and the existing international normative instruments protecting human rights and the rights of indigenous peoples.

These Ethical Principles serve as a basis for the development of specific ethics' codes and tools adapted to local and sectoral conditions:

1) Communities, groups and, where applicable, individuals should have the primary role in safeguarding their intangible cultural heritage.

2) The right of communities, groups and, where appropriate, individuals to continue the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge and skills necessary to ensure the viability of the intangible cultural heritage should be recognized and respected.

3) Mutual respect, as well as respect for and mutual appreciation of intangible cultural heritage, should prevail in interactions between states and between communities, groups and, where applicable, individuals.

4) All interactions with the communities, groups and, where applicable, individuals who create, safeguard, maintain and transmit intangible cultural heritage should be characterized by transparent collaboration, dialogue, negotiation and consultation, and be contingent upon their free, prior, sustained and informed consent.

5) Access of communities, groups and individuals to the instruments, objects, artefacts, cultural and natural spaces and places of memory whose existence is necessary for expressing the intangible cultural heritage should be ensured, including in situations of armed conflict. Customary practices governing access to intangible cultural heritage should be fully respected, even where these may limit broader public access.

6) Each community, group or individual should assess the value of its intangible cultural heritage, and this intangible cultural heritage should not be subject to external judgements of value or worth.

7) The communities, groups and individuals who create intangible cultural heritage should benefit from the protection of the moral and material interests resulting from such heritage, and particularly from its use, research, documentation, promotion or adaptation by members of the communities or others.

8) The dynamic and living nature of intangible cultural heritage should be continuously respected. Authenticity and exclusivity should not constitute concerns and obstacles in the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage.

9) Communities, groups, local, national and transnational organizations and individuals should carefully assess the direct and indirect, short-term and long-term, potential and definitive impact of any action that may affect the viability of intangible cultural heritage or the communities who practise it.

10) Communities, groups and, where applicable, individuals should play a significant role in determining what constitutes threats to their intangible cultural heritage including the decontextualization, commodification and misrepresentation of it, as well as in deciding how to prevent and mitigate such risks.

11) Cultural diversity and the identities of communities, groups and individuals should be fully respected. In respect of values recognized by communities, groups and individuals and sensitivity to cultural norms, specific attention to gender equality, youth involvement and respect for ethnic identities should be included in the design and implementation of safeguarding measures.

12) The safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage is of general interest to humanity and should, therefore, be undertaken through cooperation among bilateral, sub-regional, regional and international parties; nevertheless, communities, groups and, where applicable, individuals should never be alienated from their intangible cultural heritage.

(UNESCO 2003).

For more information on this topic, see also UNESCO's Publication "Ethical Principles for Safeguarding Intangible Cultural Heritage" (2015), URL: https://ich.unesco.org/en/ethics-and-ich-00866

Annex 2 - Kit for the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage

The UNESCO prepared a "Kit for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage" which is available on the UNESCO homepage at https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#6

The kit is a basic reference and pedagogical instrument "for promoting and ensuring an effective understanding of intangible cultural heritage and the 2003 Convention by governments, communities, experts, concerned UN agencies, NGOs and interested individuals" (UNESCO). It was first published in September 2009 and has been regularly updated ever since.

UNESCO conceived of it as a flexible tool, in which new brochures adapted to the local situation can be included and it is of great importance for the ARTISTIC project.

Nine brochures compose the kit and fact sheets on 12 safeguarding projects that can be downloaded under the following links:

- **What is Intangible Cultural Heritage?:** https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#1
- **The 2003 Convention:** https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#2
- **Implementing the 2003 Convention:** https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#3
- **Working towards the 2003 Convention:** https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#4
- **Questions & Answers:** https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#5
- **Inventorying Intangible Cultural Heritage:** https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#6
- **Intangible Cultural Heritage domains:** https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#7
- **Intangible Cultural Heritage and Sustainable Development** (published in November 2015): https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#8
- **Intangible Cultural Heritage and Gender** (published in November 2015): https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#9
- **Fact sheets on Intangible Cultural Heritage:** https://ich.unesco.org/en/kit#10

Dr. Eliane Fernandes Ferreira
Prof. Dr. Gertraud Koch

PP 8 / Universität Hamburg
Edmund-Siemers-Allee 1 (West)
20146 Hamburg
Germany

eliane.fernandes.ferreira@uni-hamburg.de
gertraud.koch@uni-hamburg.de

+49 (0)40-42838 6515
+49 (0)40-42838 2014

Universität Hamburg
DER FORSCHUNG | DER LEHRE | DER BILDUNG